# Southern Environmental Law Center

Telephone 404-521-9900

TEN 10TH STREET NW, SUITE 1050 ATLANTA, GA 30309-3848 Facsimile 404-521-9909

August 15, 2018

AUG 1 5 2018 EXECUTIVE SECRETARY G.P.S.C.

#### VIA HAND DELIVERY

Mr. Reece McAlister Executive Secretary Georgia Public Service Commission 244 Washington Street, SW Atlanta, Georgia 30334

#### RE: Response to \$2.3 Billion Price Increase for Plant Vogtle Units 3 and 4

Dear Mr. McAlister:

Please find enclosed an original, 15 copies, and an electronic version of a Letter to Commissioners addressing the \$2.3 billion price increase for Plant Vogtle Units 3 and 4 to be filed in Docket 29849 on behalf of Georgia Interfaith Power & Light and Partnership for Southern Equity.

Respectfully submitted,

Jillian Kysor Staff Attorney Southern Environmental Law Center Ten 10<sup>th</sup> St., NW, Suite 1050 Atlanta, Georgia 30309 404-521-9900 sshelton@selcga.org

## Southern Environmental Law Center

Telephone 404-521-9900

TEN 10TH STREET NW, SUITE 1050 ATLANTA, GA 30309-3848 Facsimile 404-521-9909

August 15, 2018

#### VIA HAND DELIVERY

Georgia Public Service Commission 244 Washington Street, SW Atlanta, Georgia 30334

#### Re: Response to \$2.3 Billion Price Increase for Plant Vogtle Units 3 and 4; Docket 29849

Dear Commissioners:

We are writing in light of Southern Company's recent announcement that the cost of the Vogtle expansion project has risen by another \$2.3 billion. While the announcement was made after the conclusion of evidence and testimony in this 18<sup>th</sup> VCM, we believe it has clear relevance to one of the issues now before the Commission. Specifically, the announcement illustrates why the Commission should adopt Staff's recommendation to require Georgia Power to include in future VCM filings more detailed information on project risks, including an up-to-date contingency analysis.

On one level, the Company's announcement was not surprising in light of the project's dismal track record, with ten-figure price increases practically becoming the norm. On another level, however, the announcement is wholly unexpected and alarming. It comes just months after this Commission approved, as "reasonable," a several billion dollar budget increase. And it comes after testimony in this proceeding that gave no hint that another major price increase was in the offing. Instead, the testimony conveyed the exact opposite impression. Reporting on the results of a months-long "re-baselining effort" with the new contractor, Bechtel, Georgia Power witness Stephen Kuczynski, the chairman, president and chief executive officer of Southern Nuclear Operating Company, testified that "we don't see anything of any significance out of that process that would change kind of Bechtel's target cost and schedule." (Tr. at 68). Similarly, when asked about the risk of cost increases under the cost-plus agreement with Bechtel, witness Jeremiah Haswell, project oversight director for Georgia Power, stated that "what we're looking at so far would not change our 7.3 billion estimate." (Tr. at 121).

Nearly two months later, Staff gave similar testimony based on its ongoing discussions with Georgia Power – discussions which, according to Staff, had reached new levels of transparency. (Tr. at 363). In response to questioning from Georgia Power's counsel, Staff testified that the depth and detail of project information made available to Staff had "definitely increased" since Southern Nuclear took direct control of the project. (Id.). Regarding the Bechtel review process, Staff testified that the review was now complete and that Staff's understanding was that there were "maybe a few very minor items but nothing material, nothing significant." (Tr. at 253). Although Staff expressed concerns about the achievability of the +21 schedule and the near total allocation of the \$1.1 billion contingency, Staff clearly had no reason to believe that an increase of more than \$2 billion lurked right around the corner.

Something is clearly amiss here. The VCM process can hardly be considered transparent when surprises of this magnitude can surface within weeks of testimony suggesting that things are going well under the new arrangement. It's worth noting that Staff made its recommendation for greater transparency of risks and contingency prior to this latest bombshell. Even while agreeing that transparency had improved under the new management structure, Staff saw the need for even greater transparency. Staff has (again) been proved correct. If adopted, Staff's recommendation should make it less likely that additional eye-popping increases arrive without warning.

We're aware that Southern Company has pledged to absorb the \$1.1 billion in added costs that represent Georgia Power's share of the total increase. That customers are not being asked to fund this additional increase is certainly a welcome development. Customers would be advised not to put too much stock in this pledge, however, as the Company's actual position appears to be that the increased "contingency" totaling \$400 million, "may be presented to the Georgia PSC for evaluation as and when appropriate in the future."<sup>1</sup> Moreover, nothing prevents Georgia Power from ultimately seeking to recover the entire sum. As long as there is no cap on project costs, Georgia Power retains that right.

The Company's press statements seem designed to obscure pain to customers associated with this new cost increase. Even if Georgia Power never seeks to recover the \$1.1 billion in new capital costs from customers, \$350 million in increased financing costs will go on customers' tabs.<sup>2</sup> And then there is the pain that will be felt by non-Georgia Power customers. The overall project increase of \$2.3 billion includes a \$1.2 billion increase for the other project owners who, as the Commission is well aware, have no shareholders to absorb the loss. Hence, customers of those participating utilities will bear the full brunt of the new cost increases incurred by Georgia Power as their agent. While this Commission does not regulate the other project participants, the project would not have gone forward past late last year without the Commission's blessing.

In short, there is simply no sugar-coating this latest development. Unbelievably, after nearly a decade of construction monitoring proceedings, there is still no safeguard against billion-dollar surprises. The Commission can take necessary steps toward providing one by adopting Staff's recommendation to increase transparency in all future VCM filings.

Respectfully Submitted,

Kurt Ebersbach Jillian Kysor

https://s2.q4cdn.com/471677839/files/doc\_financials/2018/SO-2018-Q2-Earnings-Call-FINAL.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Press Release, Georgia Power, Significant progress made on Vogtle 3 & 4 (Aug. 8, 2018), available at https://www.georgiapower.com/company/news-center/press-releases.html.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> According to Southern Company's recent announcement, \$350 million in financing costs associated with the \$1.1 billion budget increase will be shifted to AFUDC - an account that customers pay. Second Quarter 2018 Earnings Conference Call presentation, slide 4, n. 1 (Aug. 8, 2018), available at

Southern Environmental Law Center Ten 10<sup>th</sup> St., NW, Suite 1050 Atlanta, Georgia 30309 kebersbach@selcga.org jkysor@selcga.org

### cc: All parties of record

#### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I certify that the foregoing Letter to Commissioners on behalf of Georgia Interfaith Power & Light and Partnership for Southern Equity in Docket No. 29849 was filed with the Public Service Commission by hand delivery on the 15<sup>th</sup> of August, 2018. An electronic copy of same was served upon all parties listed below by electronic mail as follows:

**Hllian Kysor** 

Reece McAlister Executive Secretary Georgia Public Service Commission 244 Washington Street, S.W. Atlanta, Georgia 30334 reecem@psc.state.ga.us

Kevin Greene, Esq. Brandon F. Marzo, Esq. Steve J. Hewitson, Esq. Troutman Sanders LLP Nations Bank Plaza 600 Peachtree St., NE, Suite 5200 Atlanta, Georgia 30308 kevin.greene@troutmansanders.com brandon.marzo@troutmansanders.com

Jeffry Pollock J. Pollock Incorporated 12647 Olive Blvd., Suite 585 St. Louis, Missouri 63141 jcp@jpollockinc.com

Ben J Stockton, PE, MBA Executive Director Concerned Ratepayers of Georgia 2305 Global Forum Blvd, Suite 912 Atlanta, GA 30340 encomanager13@gmail.com Jeffrey Stair, Esq. Georgia Public Service Commission 244 Washington Street, S.W. Atlanta, Georgia 30334 jeffreys@psc.state.ga.us

Randall D. Quintrell Randall D. Quintrell, P.C. 999 Peachtree Street, N.E., 23rd Floor Atlanta, Georgia 30309-3996 randyquintrell@eversheds-sutherland.com

Jim Clarkson Resource Supply Management 1370 Walcora Dr. Sumter, SC 29150 jclarkson@rsmenergy.com

Steven C Prenovitz, MBA Consultant Concerned Ratepayers of Georgia 4295 Amberglade Ct Norcross, GA 30092 scprenovitz@gmail.com Mr. G. L. Bowen, III Charles B. Jones, III Georgia Association of Manufacturers The Hurt Building 50 Hurt Plaza, Suite 985 Atlanta, Georgia 30303 rbowen@gamfg.org cjones@gamfg.org

J. Reneé Kastanakis Sara Barczak Kastanakis Law, LLC Southern Alliance for Clean Energy 1350 Avalon Place, N.E. Atlanta, Georgia 30306 rkastanakis@aol.com sara@cleanenergy.org Liz Coyle Georgia Watch 55 Marietta Street N.W. Suite 903 Atlanta, GA 30303 lcoyle@georgiawatch.org